



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	International Journal of TROPICAL DISEASE & Health
Manuscript Number:	2013_IJTDH_5966
Title of the Manuscript:	VALIDITY OF ACID-FAST SMEAR OF GASTRIC ASPIRATES FOR THE DIAGNOSIS OF CHILDHOOD PULMONARY TUBERCULOSIS AMONG HUMAN IMMUNODEFICIENCY VIRUS-INFECTED CHILDREN

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
The paper has been greatly improved. A few remaining issues: In table 1, it is better to calculate percentages in columns (vertically) rather than in rows. For example radiological findings were present in 115/119 HIV-positives (99%) vs. 109/147 (74%) in HIV-negatives. In the abstract and in line 172 it is stated that the sensitivity was 38.3% in HIV-infected but in line 187 this is said (I believe in error) that this was 38.5. It is somewhat surprising that the study period has been shortened by 10 months since the first draft, but I guess the shorter study period is the correct one. As confidence intervals are provided for sensitivity and specificity, it would be better also to provide this for the positive and negative predictive values.	Thanks. 38.5 in line 187 is modified to 38.3 For avoidance of imprecision in study duration statement, and in response to reviewer's strong comments, the duration of participant recruitment (and specimen collection) was specifically stated in line 54 of the 1 st revision. Confidence intervals for PPVs and NPVs have been provided in lines 178,180,185,187 of the 2 nd revision.